Organizational Aesthetics as a Contribution in the Management of Entrepreneurial Organizations: Systematic Literature Review and Qualitative Meta-Synthesis

Inara Antunes Vieira Willerding, MsC
Management Engineering
Federal University of Santa Catarina
Florianópolis, Santa Catarina
Brazil

Édis Mafra Lapolli, Dra
Production Engineering
Federal University of Santa Catarina
Florianópolis, Santa Catarina
Brazil

Abstract

Facing an increasingly turbulent and global environment, today's market scenario requires dynamism and prompt and efficient decision-making, generating a need for constant changes in management strategies. Through a systematic literature review and a qualitative meta-synthesis, this paper searches the answer for the following research question: How does organizational aesthetics help in managing entrepreneurial organizations? For this research, two databases were used - Scopus and Web of Science, integrated to the ISI Web of Knowledge database. After analysis of the papers found on those databases, it can be stated that organizational aesthetics refers to a form of human knowledge and therefore helps in the analysis of the complexity, the ambiguity and the subtleties perceived in the everyday life of organizations, so changes that may reflect on strategies and competitive advantage can be made, according to best practices, developing their capacity for creativity and innovation.

Keywords: Organizational Aesthetics. Entrepreneurial Organizations

1. Initial Consideration

The challenge of acting in a scenario of uncertainty and frequent change is common for contemporary organizations since every day, as the future becomes more uncertain, companies are immersed in complex environments, constantly clashing with challenges and organization difficulties that need to be managed in the best possible way so that appropriate solutions are quickly found.

In recent decades, organizations needed to adapt to new conditions by integrating people, structure and processes and incorporating various practices in management, thus having a greater influence on behavior, organizational culture and people management. Looking for market consolidation, where their activities would perpetuate, organizations come across the need to have an increasingly better capital, which is only achieved through knowledge - the so-called intellectual capital.

In this context, the role of the individual is defined in the contemporary world as an agent and social actor who holds the knowledge and transforms it, and when facing managerial decisions in the exercise of their powers, may achieve competitive advantage and overcome competitors.

Organizations in this sphere have sought their contemporaneity in a new organizational, self-renovator model based on entrepreneurship: the entrepreneurial organization, as it allows individuals and teams to act as internal entrepreneurs (intrapreneurs), towards greater efficiency in the quest for new opportunities and in innovation processes.

This requires the assignment of good managers who have a greater sensitivity to perceive and anticipate these changes, and interpret them in the best way so that they correspond to the organizational goal, seeking continuous improvement. Such improvements are enhanced; not being subjects to the environmental factor, they must also consider the evolutionary value of the collaborator and their adaptability and flexibility toward experiences.

Perception can be understood as the information received through any sensory means, i.e., through any of the individual's senses. We can also assert that it is not only about perceiving but also being able to, or knowing how to, interpret what is perceived. The process of perception consists of two steps. The first one refers to information that is captured through senses, and the second one to the processing and interpretation of that information, generating knowledge as a result.

It is important to stress that perception is limited by determination, both by the cunning of senses and by the skills, the ability to understand, the experience, knowledge and intelligence of the individual. Each individual has a unique way of perceiving because interpretation depends on their experience, intelligence and attention, corresponding to their experiential world and their previous knowledge.

Tavares and Kilimnik (2007) argue that one way to gain knowledge of difficult verbal, cognitive and rational expression is through aesthetics; this being broadly understood as the acquisition of knowledge through senses. This knowledge acquisition through aesthetic experience builds the foundation of cognitive processes involved in the attainment and development of individual and organizational knowledge (Gagliardi, 1999).

The author also explains that the aesthetic knowledge or sensory knowledge is usually unconscious or tacit, untranslatable into words or verbalized. It is also a form of communication (which differs from verbalization) that happens while expressive actions - or the artifacts they produce - become objects of sensory knowledge, as a way of transmitting and sharing inexpressible knowledge.

Strati (2007, p. 580) states that when approaching these two forms of knowledge, tacit and aesthetic, it is possible to enhance organizational studies because the "aesthetic reading of the organization questions the organizational knowledge based on analytical methods of study" (Strati, 1992, p. 580) and adds other sources to the understanding of organizational life.

In a contemporary environment and "struggling" for survival in its field, the organization builds on the individual and their intellectual capital, driven by their cognitive knowledge, supported by perception, together with their uniqueness to observe and perceive, thus generating aesthetic knowledge.

According to Strati (2007) aesthetics in organizational life relates to a form of human knowledge specifically provided by sense perception - hearing, sight, touch, smell and taste -, and also our ability to make an aesthetic judgment, since aesthetic judgment evaluates whether something is pleasant or not, whether it corresponds to liking or disliking, if we are indifferent to it or even disgusted by it.

Over time, the influence of organizational aesthetics substantially contributes to the development of knowledge. As stated by Schiavo (2010, p. 30), "the aesthetics comprises a form of human knowledge that originates from the sense organs and our ability to make an aesthetic judgment".

Given the above, an aesthetic approach is relevant in order to understand the tacit character of organizational knowledge, questioning the use of cognition as the exclusive means of creating and sharing knowledge, besides providing the understanding that *knowing* is, in practice, experienced and sustained by the senses. This begins in the process of perception and goes on to the construction of knowledge, so that changes that may reflect in organizational and competitive advantage strategies can be made, discussing the possibilities of the contribution of aesthetic dimension to the ambiguity and subtlety that are perceived in the routine of a contemporary organization.

2. Methodological Procedures

The process of systematic literature review requires the preparation of a synthesis based on different topics, capable of creating a broad understanding about knowledge. It refers to a first step towards the production of scientific knowledge since from this process new theories emerge, and gaps, biases and opportunities are identified in order to originate new studies in a specific subject (Botelho, Cunha and Macedo, 2011).

Defined by Greenhalgh (1997, p. 672) "as a synthesis of primary studies with clearly stated objectives, materials and methods, which is conducted according to a clear and reproducible methodology", it gathers a certain number of records, discussing the differences between primary studies that have the same research object.

The use of systematic literature review aims the search for primary sources of evidence in order to organize the vast number of records, speeches and scientific information as well as to identify texts, make critical assessments and synthesize relevant studies to a particular topic, systematically in its approach, using the rigorous methods explained further on. To this end, Barroso and Gollop (2003) state that there is a need for previous planning.

The use of systematic literature review as a source of evidence to organize the growing number of products, interventions and scientific information is rapidly increasing, replacing the primary research in decision making [...] (translated from Lopes & Fracolli, 2008, p. 772)

In response to this growing number of scientific works, we can affirm that nowadays there is a need to synthesize the produced knowledge and select the relevant research from those irrelevant to the given topic by conducting systematic reviews of the literature.

The systematic literature review is a structured review, aiming to answer a research question by using explicit and systematic methods to identify, select and critically assess studies and to collect and analyze data presented by them (Castro, 2006).

It is important to mention that before initiating a systematic literature review, three preliminary steps need to be considered to assist and adapt the guiding question of the review, based on the information available on the object of interest: defining the purpose of the review, identifying related literature and selecting studies that should be included (Domholdt, 2005).

To perform an integrative literature review, five stages were defined as the search strategy for the proposed topic, as well as the relevant aspects to be considered when using this feature.

1st. Step: identifying the subject, formulating the research question and the keywords - for this paper, we proposed the following question: How does organizational aesthetics help in managing entrepreneurial organizations? Then, we established the following keywords: "Entrepreneurial Organizations" and "Organizational Aesthetics".

2nd. Step: identification and justification of databases and filters used in the research. Two databases were chosen - *Scopus*, for being one of the largest databases of abstracts and bibliographical references from peer-reviewed scientific literature, and being up to date, which allows a broad view of everything that is being scientifically registered on a certain topic, providing the researcher sufficient information to support their research; and the *Web of Science* database, for its multidisciplinary references and forbeing integrated to the *ISI Web of Knowledge* database, which has approximately 12,000 journals and provides tools for the analysis of citations, references and index, enabling bibliometric analysis, and is also considered one of the major databases. The filters set for this systematic search were determined first by the most relevant fields for this research, and second by a time frame of the last five years of registration, i.e. records from 2009 to 2013. Table 1 shows the number of records for each keyword indicated for this study.

Regarding the subareas, after checking the records in several areas, the researcher determined the following as the most relevant areas in the *Scopus* database: Business; Management and Accounting; Social Sciences; Decision Sciences; Psychology; Multidisciplinary; Undefined, and in the *Web of Science* database: Business; History of social sciences; Public administration; Management; Psychology; Multidisciplinary; Social issues; Psychology applied. The filter referring to the time frame of the last five years of publication, i.e. records from 2009 to 2013, is due to the fact that the researcher considered being relevant to search for recent publications.

3rd. Step: Bibliometric analysis and establishment of criteria for inclusion and exclusion of records - this step refers to the results outlined in the previous step and acts as a conductor resource for a diverse sample, requiring greater analysis criteria from the researcher (Pereira & Bachion, 2006). For the author, bibliometrics aims access to bibliographic control. Macias-Chapula (1998, p. 134) corroborates it, conceptualizing bibliometrics as "the study of quantitative aspects of the production, dissemination and use of information recorded. [...] develops patterns and mathematical models to measure these processes, using their results to develop predictions and support decision making".

At the end of this step, as a last filter we selected the ten most relevant records according to researched databases, as well as the ten biggest-impact records of contextual quotes based on the total number of citations to a given topic.

4th. Step: Identification of pre-selected and selected studies - identified in the systematic literature search, the pre-selection of publications is performed by evaluation of titles, keywords and abstracts. After this process and strictly obeying the criteria for inclusion and exclusion predefined by the researcher, complete publications ought to be searched and found by the search strategy, to further verification of its adequacy and observance to the research.

5th. Step: Presenting the results - seeks to present the obtained results and to evaluate the delineation of each selected publication; how they were conducted; and the results found, for the next step which is the data collection itself.

6th. Step: Data collection - data is collected from each individual selected study. This step ensures accurate checking of data. It is noteworthy that data collection is related to each conducted systematic review, guided by the research question established at the beginning of the search process.

7th. Step: Synthesis of data - aims to synthesize the data from the search, in order to provide an estimate of the effectiveness of the investigated intervention.

8th. Step: Synthesis of data - seeks to limit biases, group, evaluate and synthesize all relevant studies that answer a research question, and also keep researchers up-to-date from the viewpoint of recent publications, since it synthesizes a large amount of knowledge and helps to explain the differences between studies with the same guiding question. It represents the end of the systematic literature review, through the elaboration of concerns about the state of the art of the researched topic based on analysis of the selected records.

2.1 Implementation of Research in *Scopus* and *Web of Science* Databases

The search began with the keyword "Entrepreneurial Organizations" in titles, abstracts and key words. We did an idiomatic translation of the keyword to expand the search field, regarding possible ways of writing the same thing. As a result of the translation the following words were generated: *Entrepreneurial Organizations; Entrepreneurial Organisations; Entrepreneurial organization; Entrepreneurial Organizational; Entrepreneurial Organized Group; Enterprising Organizations; Enterprising Organisations; Enterprising organization; Enterprising Organizational; Enterprising Organized Group; Entrepreneurs Organizations; Entrepreneurs Organisations; Entrepreneurs organization; Entrepreneurs Organizational; Entrepreneurs Organized Group.*

As results in the Scopus database 232 published records were found, being the first record from 1970. It is important to stress that from 1971 to 1982 there were no records, as well as in the years of 1985, 1987 and 1989.

125 records were found using the first filter, related to the relevant research areas and excluding other areas. With respect to the second filter, time frame of the last five years, we obtained 58 records.

The next step is related to a bibliometric analysis, in which it was established as criteria for inclusion and exclusion of records the most relevant publications and most quoted publications according to the Scopus database. It is important to stress that the most cited publication had 62 quotes and the less cited among the ten selected records had six quotes.

As a result of the *Web of Science* database search, 101 published records were found, with the first record having been published in 1956. It is import to stress that from 1956 to 1973 and from 1975 to 1980 there were no records, as well as in 1985, 1987, 1988 and 1990.

41 records were found using the first filter related to relevant research areas and excluding the other. With respect to the second filter, time frame of the last five years, we obtained 14 records.

The next step is related to bibliometric analysis, the ten most relevant publications and the ten most cited according to the database at issue.

The next search strategy used the keyword "organizational aesthetics" in titles, abstracts and keywords. As a result of idiomatic translation, the following variations were generated: "organizational aesthetics"; "organisational aesthetics"; "organizational aesthetic"; "organizational esthetics"; organizational esthetic; "organisational aesthetic"; "organisational esthetics"; organisational esthetic.

As a result 49 published records were found, being the first record from 1971 and highlighting that from 1972 to 1993 there were no records, as well as in the years of 1995, 1997, 1999 and 2000. Using the filter referring to the areas of interest we obtained 27 publications, and after the second filter related to the time frame 13 records appeared. The next step relates to a bibliometric analysis for the ten most relevant records, obtained as a result of search according to established strategy, and ten most cited records, the first of which having been quoted 22 times.

The same procedure was performed in the *Web of Science* database and 40 records were found, being the first record published in 1974 and highlighting that in 1975 and 1977 to 1991 there were no records, as well as from 1993 to 2001.

31 publications appeared using the filter referring to the areas of interest, and after the second filter related to the time frame, we obtained 13 records.

The next step is related to a bibliometric analysis for the ten most relevant records and the ten the ten most cited records.

The next step of the research refers to the search itself through the intersection of keywords. The first search was conducted with the intersection of the constructs "entrepreneurial organizations" and "organizational aesthetics", which showed only 1 record in the area of *Business, Management and Accounting*, being published in 2010.

The search performed with the intersection of the constructs "entrepreneurial organizations" and "organizational aesthetics" within *Web of Science* database did not return any records.

The next step to be performed refers to the identification of pre-selected and selected studies (4th. Step), where after the selection of the published studies shown by the adopted search strategies, it was necessary to review the abstracts identified in the initial search, for selection of publications actually connected to the research. Table 2 presents the records that were selected after analysis.

After connecting the two databases (*Scopus* and *Web of Science*) we verified the duplications, triplicates and even quadruplicates existing in the 44 records displayed by the databases. Table 3 shows the records that were effectively selected after verification.

The analysis of the focus and content of the 29 selected records will be related to their connection to the research.

3. Results and Analysis of Research

The analysis of the approach and content of the 29 selected records was performed for their connection to the research. Table 4 below shows the 17 papers considered relevant in order to answer the research question proposed by this study, having "Entrepreneurial Organizations" as keyword.

Moore, D.; Moore, J. and Moore, J. (2011) in the publication called *How women entrepreneurs lead and why they manage that wa*y investigate the "leadership style" of women in organizations, verifying that women apply collaboration behaviors in order to create an atmosphere of trust in workgroups and that this form of leadership generates a number of positive outcomes, thus improving individual and organizational performance.

Clargo and Tunstall (2011) in the paper *Leading an entrepreneurial workforce: Development or decline?* analyze the entrepreneurial practice within organizations, seeking to identify the entrepreneurial propensity of collaborators at all levels of the organization, considering positive and negative potential of this inclination in the organization. As a result of the research, we can identify that collaborators in the sales function of the company had a greater propensity to entrepreneurship compared to other departments in the organization. The authors argue that organizational structure, opportunity and needs must fulfill individual skills, experience and desire to create development opportunities for organizations. They further argue that managers should consider the entrepreneurship ability among collaborators and their potential for the development of the business.

Invernizzi, Romenti and Fumagalli (2012) in *Identity, communication and change management in Ferrari* investigate the role of strategic communication during a process of management of change within the Ferrari Corporation. They sought to address that the four components of strategic communication (aligning, energizing, visioning, and constituting), if applied in an integrated manner, can insightfully stimulate management and therefore be a key lever for continuous improvement of the organization, thus boosting for organizational success. Ng and Kee (2013) in the publication called *Organisational culture can be a double-edged sword for firm performance* claim that there are traditional and critical perspectives on the concept of organizational culture.

The dominant perspective argues that organizational culture plays a key role in influencing organization members to achieve the company's performance levels. On the other hand, critical perspective sees organizational culture as a hindrance to progress or even a source of failure for the company. This way, organizations must adopt an appropriate organizational culture to achieve success but also need to be aware of existing traps, if they consider organizational culture something useful for the company as it may serve as an important driver for change and high performance in the long run.

Authors Davis and Bingham (2009) in *Optimal structure, market dynamism, and the strategy of simple rules* aimed at the development of a more accurate theory about the relationship between structure, performance and environment. They claim that this interaction is asymmetric and that the different dynamism dimensions of the environment (speed, complexity, ambiguity and unpredictability) have unique effects on organizational performance - increasing unpredictability, diminishing the excellent structure and strengthening their effective strategies. Juxtaposing the structural challenges of adapting established organizations, the authors speculate that organizations must quickly apply this structure to all environments, since stable environments are more desirable unless one can devote enough time to managing balance in the structure within unpredictable environments.

Nanda and Sørensen (2010) in the publication called *Workplace peers and entrepreneurship*, examined the likelihood of business activities being related to the previous career experiences of coworkers of an individual. The authors argue that coworkers can increase the likelihood of an individual to perceive entrepreneurial opportunities and increase their motivation in seeking these opportunities. They also affirm that individuals who have entrepreneurial features have greater influence on their peers than those who have less exposure to entrepreneurship in other aspects of their lives.

O'Cass and Weerawardena (2009) in *Examining the role of international entrepreneurship, innovation and international market performance in SME internationalization* analyze the role of entrepreneurship and international innovation in Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs), arguing that entrepreneurial SMEs intend to enter the international market and are committed to organizational innovation, thus permitting the achievement of better market performance in relation to the intensity of organizational innovation and size, and that innovative companies are best equipped to make use of the opportunities in international market, thus having a better market performance.

In the paper *Role of entrepreneurship and market orientation in firms' success*, González-Benito, González-Benito and Muñoz-Gallego (2009) research empirical evidence on the relationship between entrepreneurship, market orientation and business performance in the context of European Union's socioeconomic disadvantaged regions. For the authors, there is a strong relationship between entrepreneurship and market orientation; although this orientation can be implemented separately, companies emphasize entrepreneurship when they are guided to the market. The strong relationship and complementarity between those aspects reduce the effort involved in adopting both orientations. For the authors, despite little evidence of synergistic effects of both orientations, they contribute to the improvement of performance and therefore companies should promote market orientation and an entrepreneurial organizational culture.

Wang and Rafiq (2009) in *Organizational diversity and shared vision: Resolving the paradox of exploratory and exploitative learning* emphasize relevant tensions to the exploration and exploitation in organizational learning perspective. They conceptualize organizational diversity and shared vision as the main components of organizational culture that help resolve these tensions, and discuss the organizational settings required for imprinting organizational diversity and shared vision. To this end, the research focuses on the role of organizational culture in the development of corporate entrepreneurship from the perspective of organizational learning. In general terms, the authors explain that organizational diversity and shared vision are important for a balanced learning, and that organizational parameters must be aligned as a condition for competitive advantage.

On the paper *Organizations as fonts of entrepreneurship* Sørensen and Fassiotto (2011) analyze the literature referring to businessmen from established organizations about the ways in which companies fit the entrepreneurial process. The authors claim that literature on this subject is recent, and focus on four different metaphors about how organizations introduce the entrepreneurial process for the emergence of promising paths.

On the selected paper from Peris-Ortiz (2009) - *An analytical model for human resource management as an enabler of organizational renewal: A framework for corporate entrepreneurship* - the author presents the development of a model related to different types of work, based on organizational theory.

She analyzes diverse characteristics of work and efficient management practices, and along with these aspects incorporates the term "corporate entrepreneurship", systematically addressing these two fields, pointing out that the instruments that allow an efficient management are the same as those required for corporate entrepreneurship enterprise and that efficient labor management is a prerequisite and a facilitator for business activity.

Engelen (2010) in *Entrepreneurial orientation as a function of national cultural variations in two countries* uses the result of a large scale survey conducted in Germany and China for developing and validating a model of internal variables that promotes entrepreneurial orientation, seeking to understand whether organizational mechanisms such as the organizational structure or leadership style that support organizations are universal or are contingent over national culture. This study indicated that some components are universal and other conditioned to culture. The author cites as an example the cross-functional integration, which has entrepreneurial orientation compared to traditional companies. According to him, the centralization of management does not behave so negatively, suggesting thus strong similarities between them in. He also states that organizations are usually not strong enough to completely offset the influences of national culture.

In *Leadership in entrepreneurial organizations: Context and motives*, Marti, Gil, Barrasa, et al. (2010) analyze the influence of organizational contexts (entrepreneurial and non entrepreneurial) on leadership, with regard to some of its characteristics which can facilitate (through weak structures) or inhibit (through strong structures) behavior of leaders. The authors emphasize that, in large part, in weak structures (entrepreneurial) the leaders' motives are more prominent than the (non-entrepreneurial) strong contexts in relation to behaviors that are directly related to the influence of organizational contexts, given by three main reasons: power, affiliation and achievement.

Platzek, Pretorius and Winzker (2010) in *A role model for entrepreneurial firms in a global business environment* discuss a model for entrepreneurial organizations in a global business environment, outlining tasks to be performed. The model can be interpreted as a synthesis between the individual and the collectivist intrapreneurship approaches, explaining various features of intrapreneurship. The authors state that nowadays the business environment requires intrapreneurship and innovation in the companies, embedded in a holistic management approach, and so that intrapreneurship is successful it is necessary a strong focus on the external and internal business environment for opportunities.

By describing the growth strategy of these organizations, in "*How do they plan for growth in auto component business?*" – *A study on small foundries of western India* Majumdar (2010) suggests that performance, business motivation, attitude and competence of entrepreneurs in planning strategy is a function of the industry structure. Based on the Grounded Theory approach in an attempt to develop a theoretical framework for strategic planning for growth in small entrepreneurial organizations, two main patterns emerge: a relationship strategy based on the entrepreneurial vision, considering the strengthening of relationships a foundation for growth planning and having as main elements *confidence, cooperation, community* and *benefits for society*; and a technology strategy, based on technology choices made by managers to achieve excellence in products and process performance, thus needing investment and risk-taking ability.

Table 5 shows the 8 records selected after analysis of content and approach for their relevance in order to answer the research question in this paper, having as keyword "Organizational Aesthetics".

Connellan (2013) in her article *The Psychic Life of White: Power and Space* relies on Foucault's theories of power and organizational aesthetics to show that people become trapped in an institutionalization of space. The author gives visual examples of the five main areas of organization: Church; State; prisons; hospitals; Universities, to discuss ways in which whiteness transcends the boundaries of temporal color and enters the psyche as an agent of power in control of spaces and themes, and posits that white is suitable for organizations to spread sameness in public spaces. The author sought to show that white is more than just a color, it is a power appropriated by institutions to maintain synchronicity.

Tsaur and Tang (2013) in the paper *The burden of esthetic labor on front-line employees in hospitality industry* researched how the hospitality industry has recently used the aesthetic work on front-line employees to provide customers the experience of a quality service. The authors also claim that front-line employees should make an effort to meet aesthetic demands and improve their personal aesthetic skills, which can be stressful for them, making them feel overwhelmed.

Therefore, the study sought to discover the sources of aesthetic workload for front-line workers in the hospitality industry in three aspects: organizational aesthetic requirements and of training; pressures of customer service; and workloads during time off, as well as suggestions for the organizations to minimize this fact.

Griffiths and Mack (2011) in *Senses of "shipscapes": An artful navigation of ship architecture and aesthetics* enter the maritime world in the context of organizational aesthetics, using naval architecture to navigate the sensory knowledge of a sailor; the sailor's sensitive knowledge is related to their practices, aesthetic taste and aesthetic link between them and the ship, connected to the sensory architectural memory. Rich, multi-sensory descriptions of two high seas tugboats were made in this research, wrapped in sensations and emotions.

Mack (2013) in *Taking an aesthetic risk in management education: Reflections on an artistic-aesthetic approach* responds to requests from the field of organizational aesthetics to study and represent the sensitive knowledge by involving the sensitivity of 54 MBA students of Organizational Behavior, making room for the organizational aesthetics. She shows that students are able to understand some of the complexities of the group's organizational life, where imaginations were stimulated with reflections that evoked creative responses, thus finding that organizational aesthetics has much more to offer in the investigation of education management in terms of making possible some forms of knowledge that cannot easily fit into traditional teaching methods.

King and Vickery (2013) in the research *Do I look right? De-familiarizing the organizational fashioning of the body* use fashion as a way to familiarize the concept of organization, considering clothes hide a number of internal processes for the economy of organizational life. The concept of fashion here refers to a heuristic form, defining the various ways in which the body, in the process of sensory and self-reflective presentation of the action of getting dressed, has a significant understanding of *knowing* in the organization, in terms of "experience", "language" and "knowledge". The purpose of the research was to identify how fashion causes changes in perception and attention to organizational phenomena, creating large gaps in knowledge, especially towards sensory experience and tacit knowledge of clothing (wearing, carrying, displaying, changing) inside (and for) organizations.

In *Organizational aesthetics: Caught between identity regulation and culture jamming*, Wasserman and Frenkel (2011) by applying insights from Lefebvre's spatial theory to an analysis of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Israel, seek a thorough comparison between the interpretations from space workers, from designers and managers, and also the researchers' own interpretations as visitors. Identifying the similarities between the interpretations of conceived and perceived spaces made it possible to validate the connection between the use of various aesthetic markers as well as the attempt of the organization to establish its identity, and the efforts of users to resist this regulation. The study seeks to simultaneously analyze, through Lefebvre's theory of space, three spaces in a single organization: the physical space, the intellectual space and the social space, which according to the author aimed at (1) Demonstrating negotiations and struggles over interpretations of organizational aesthetics; (2) Analyzing aesthetic interference as a form of intentional and unintentional efforts of collective resistance, which not only reveals the aesthetic mechanisms of regulation but actually uses them as a way of counterregulation; (3) Considering most studies in this emerging body of literature about the regulation of organization-based identities (bureaucratic and professional), trying to show how the translation of extra-organizational identity hierarchies to the system of organizational control is also mediated by organizational aesthetics.

Biehl-Missal (2011) in *Business is Show Business: Management Presentations as Performance* provides a differentiated methodological lens in reference to "theater" in organizations and shows that the inclusion of performance theory can be particularly valuable for understanding aesthetic techniques that are increasingly used in organizations. Based on the theater theory, the study represents the aesthetic experience and describes the complex interplay of set design, lighting, clothing, manager's style of performance, rhetoric, and interaction with the audience, showing that these organizational events are co-created and the theatrical performances questioned, with potential for resistance to potential changes, as well to persuasion, located in the aesthetic uniqueness of "theater".

Table 6 shows the Papers selected for the theoretical framework having "Entrepreneurial Organizations" and "Organizational Aesthetics" as keywords.

Sørensen (2010), in his research titled *St paul's conversion: The aesthetic organization of labour*, compare the two versions of "Conversion of St. Paul" (1600/1601) - a portrait of Paul that was commissioned by Monsignor (later Cardinal) Tiberio Cerasi to the Italian Renaissance painter Caravaggio - with the modern model of organization.

These comparisons show how the organization is produced in art through "aesthetic landscaping", and, in particular, how these art reproductions convey certain images and organization schemes. The painting was originally commissioned by the Catholic Church, which rejected the first version but accepted the second one. The rejected version holds radically different images, transgressors in subjectivity, collectivity and entrepreneurship. By identifying these images, the research contributes to the development of a critical approach to organizational aesthetics. The author intends to show that aesthetic landscaping is a powerful tool and that the production of these works paved the way for the division of labor in industrialism and established the entrepreneurial figure at the forefront of Western imagination, where character Paul from the second painting fits well as an entrepreneur in the knowledge society model.

4. Final Remarks

With the change in organizational structure in the new economy, a feel of partnership is being encouraged in modern companies. The roles of their collaborators also change, designed by a new posture of approach managed by organizations, searching for partnership between the organization and its employees, with more freedom and greater responsibility, characteristics of entrepreneurial companies.

Entrepreneurial organizations have as management focus to guide their employees and provide them with the means of development and individual and collective growth by fostering environments that support creativity, innovation and entrepreneurial spirit.

With this contemporary way of management, in which the participation of the individual becomes crucial, organizational aesthetics is needed, contributing to management by trying to make explicit through aesthetic the sensory perceptions and their understanding, considered to be of difficult verbal, cognitive and rational expression. This way, it assists relations of complexity, ambiguity and subtlety present in the everyday life of organizations, allowing a greater understanding of the tacit character in organizational knowledge so that changes may reflect in organizational strategies and in competitive advantage at routine practices of the company.

The research may also highlight the scarcity of papers on the construct Organizational Aesthetics, as well as the construct from the intersection of keywords "Entrepreneurial Organizations" and "Organizational Aesthetics", reinforcing the need for further research exploring this topic.

Table 1: Number of Results Shown by Databases, According to Keywords

DATABASE	*SCOPUS*	*WEB OF SCIENCE*
Entrepreneurial Organizations	232	101
Organizational Aesthetics	49	40

Source: Authors, 2014

Table 2: Total of Records after Abstract Analysis

SCOPUS DATABASE			
Keywords	**N. of records**	**N. of analyzed papers**	**N. of selected papers**
Entrepreneurial Organizations	232	20	13
Organizational Aesthetics	49	20	09
Organizações Empreendedoras e Estética Organizacional	01	01	01
WEB OF SCIENCE DATABASE			
Keywords	**N. of records**	**N. of analyzed papers**	**N. of selected papers**
Entrepreneurial Organizations	101	20	09
Organizational Aesthetics	40	20	11
Entrepreneurial Organizations and Organizational Aesthetics	01	01	01
TOTAL	**424**	**82**	**44**

Source: Authors, 2014

Table 3: Total of Selected Papers after Analysis of Duplicates, Triplicates and Quadruplicates in Databases

Keywords	N. of selected papers	N. of effective papers
Entrepreneurial Organizations	22	18
Organizational Aesthetics	20	10
Entrepreneurial Organizations and Organizational Aesthetics	01	01
TOTAL	**43**	**29**

Source: Authors, 2014.

Table 4: Articles Selected for the Theoretical Framework with Keyword "Entrepreneurial Organizations"

PAPER	AUTHOR	YEAR	JOURNAL
How women entrepreneurs lead and why they manage that way	Moore, D. P., Moore, J. L., Moore, J. W.	2011	Gender in Management 26 (3), pp. 220-233
Leading an entrepreneurial workforce: Development or decline?	Clargo, P., Tunstall, R.	2011	Education and Training 53 (8) , pp. 762-783
Identity, communication and change management in Ferrari	Invernizzi, E., Romenti, S., Fumagalli, M.	2012	Corporate Communications 17 (4), pp. 483-497
Organisational culture can be a double-edged sword for firm performance	Ng, H. S., Kee, D. M. H.	2013	Research Journal of Business Management 7 (1) , pp. 41-52
Optimal structure, market dynamism, and the strategy of simple rules	Davis, J. P., Eisenhardt, K. M., Bingham, C. B.	2009	Administrative Science Quarterly 54 (3) , pp. 413-452
Workplace peers and entrepreneurship	Nanda, R., Sørensen, J. B.	2010	Management Science 56 (7) , pp. 1116-1126
Examining the role of international entrepreneurship, innovation and international market performance in SME internationalisation	O'Cass, A., Weerawardena, J.	2009	European Journal of Marketing 43 (11) , pp. 1325-1348
Role of entrepreneurship and market orientation in firms' success	González-Benito, Ó., González-Benito, J., Muñoz-Gallego, P. A.	2009	European Journal of Marketing 43 (3-4) , pp. 500-522
Organizational diversity and shared vision: Resolving the paradox of exploratory and exploitative learning	Wang, C. L., Rafiq, M.	2009	European Journal of Innovation Management 12 (1) , pp. 86-101
Organizations as fonts of entrepreneurship	Sørensen, J. B., Fassiotto, M.A.	2011	Organization Science 22 (5) , pp. 1322-1331
An analytical model for human resource management as an enabler of organizational renewal: A framework for corporate entrepreneurship	Peris-Ortiz, M.	2009	International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal 5 (4), pp. 461-479
Entrepreneurial orientation as a function of national cultural variations in two countries	Engelen, Andreas	2010	Journal of International Management. Volume: 16 Edição: 4 Edição especial: SI Páginas: 354-368
Leadership in entrepreneurial organizations: Context and motives	Marti Ripoll, Margarita; Gil Rodriguez, Francisco; Barrasa, Angel; et al.	2010	Psicothema. Volume: 22 Edição: 4 Páginas: 880-886
A role model for entrepreneurial firms in a global business environment	Platzek, Bernd; Pretorius, Leon; Winzker, Dietmar	2010	6th International Scientific Conference Business and Management. Data: may 13-14
Examining the role of international entrepreneurship, innovation and international market performance in SME internationalisation	O'Cass, Aron; Weerawardena, Jay	2009	European Journal of Marketing Volume: 43 Edição: 11-12 Páginas: 1325-1348
'How do they plan for growth in auto component business?' - A study on small foundries of western India	Majumdar, Satyajit	2010	Journal of Business Venturing Volume: 25 Edição: 3. Páginas: 274-289

Source: Authors, 2014.

Table 5: Papers Selected for the Theoretical Framework with "Organizational Aesthetics" as Keyword

PAPER	AUTHOR	YEAR	JOURNAL
The Psychic Life of White: Power and Space	Connellan, K.	2013	Organization Studies 34 (10) , pp. 1529-1549
The burden of esthetic labor on front-line employees in hospitality industry	Tsaur, S.-H., Tang, W.-H.	2013	International Journal of Hospitality Management 35, pp. 19-27
Senses of "shipscapes": An artful navigation of ship architecture and aesthetics	Griffiths, J., Mack, K.	2011	Journal of Organizational Change Management 24 (6), pp. 733-750
Show us the sound! Aesthetic leadership of symphony orchestra conductors	Koivunen, N., Wennes, G.	2011	Leadership 7 (1), pp. 51-71
Taking an aesthetic risk in management education: Reflections on an artistic-aesthetic approach	Mack, K.	2013	Management Learning 6 44 (3), pp. 286-304
Do I look right? De-familiarizing the organizational fashioning of the body	King, I.W., Vickery, J.	2013	Scandinavian Journal of Management 29 (4) , pp. 394-401
Organizational aesthetics: Caught between identity regulation and culture jamming	Wasserman, V., Frenkel, M.	2011	Organization Science 9 22 (2), pp. 503-521
Business is Show Business: Management Presentations as Performance	Biehl-Missal, Brigitte	2011	Journal of Management Studies Volume: 48 Issue: 3 Pages: 619-645

Source: Authors, 2014.

Table 6: Papers Selected for the Theoretical Framework Having "Entrepreneurial Organizations" and "Organizational Aesthetics" as Keywords

PAPER	AUTHOR	YEAR	JOURNAL
St paul's conversion: The aesthetic organization of labour	Sørensen, B.M.	2010	Organization Studies 31 (3), pp. 307-326

Source: Authors, 2014.

References

Barroso, J., Gollop C. J., Sandelowski, M., Meynell, J., Pearce, P. F. & Collins L. J. (2003, March). The Challenges of Searching for and Retrieving Qualitative Studies. West J Nurs Res. 25(2), pp. 153-78.

Biehl-Missal, B. (2011). Business is Show Business: Management Presentations as Performance. Journal of Management Studies. 48, pp. 619-645.

Botelho, L. L. R., Cunha, C. C. de A. & Macedo, M. (2011, May/August). O método da revisão integrativa nos estudos organizacionais. Gestão e Sociedade, Belo Horizonte, 5(11), pp. 121-136.

Castro, A. A. (2006). Curso de revisão sistemática e metanálise. São Paulo: LED-DIS/UNIFESP. Available from www.virtual.epm.br/cursos/metanalise. [Accessed on: 27 jan. 2014].

Clargo, P. & Tunstall, R. (2011). Leading an entrepreneurial workforce: Development or decline? Education and Training, 53 (8), pp. 762-783.

Connellan, K. (2013). The Psychic Life of White: Power and Space. Organization Studies, 34(10), pp. 1529-1549.

Davis, J. P., Eisenhardt, K. M. & Bingham, C. B. (2009). Optimal structure, market dynamism, and the strategy of simple rules. Administrative Science Quarterly, 54(3), pp. 413-452.

Domholdt, E. (2005). Rehabilitation research: principles and applications. Missouri: Elsevier Saunders.

Engelen, A. (2010). Entrepreneurial orientation as a function of national cultural variations in two countries. Journal of International Management, 16 (4), pp. 354-368.

Gagliardi, P. (1999). Theories empowering for action. Journal of Management Inquiry, 8 (2), pp.143-147.

González-Benito, Ó., González-Benito, J. & Muñoz-Gallego, P. A. (2009) Role of entrepreneurship and market orientation in firms' success. European Journal of Marketing, 43 (3-4), pp. 500-522.

Griffiths, J. & Mack, K. (2011). Senses of "shipscapes": An artful navigation of ship architecture and aesthetics. Journal of Organizational Change Management, 24 (6), pp. 733-750.

Greenhalgh, T. (1997, September). Papers that summarize other papers (systematic review and meta-analyses). British Medical Journal, London, 315 (7109) pp. 672-675.

Invernizzi, E., Romenti, S. & Fumagalli, M. (2012). Identity, communication and change management in Ferrari. Corporate Communications, 17 (4), pp. 483-497.

King, I. W. & Vickery, J. (2013). Do I look right? De-familiarizing the organizational fashioning of the body. Scandinavian Journal of Management, 29 (4), pp. 394-401.

Koivunen, N. & Wennes, G. (2011). Show us the sound! Aesthetic leadership of symphony orchestra conductors. Leadership, 7 (1), pp. 51-71.

Lopes, A. L. M. & Fracolli, L. A. (2008, Oct./Dec) Revisão sistemática de literatura e metassíntese qualitativa: considerações sobre sua aplicação na pesquisa em enfermagem. Texto & Contexto - enferm. 17(4), pp. 771-778. Available from http://www.scielo.br/pdf/tce/v17n4/20.pdf. [Accessed on: 27 Jul. 2014].

Macias-Chapula, C. A. (1998, May/Aug). O papel da informetria e da cienciometria e sua perspectiva nacional e internacional. Ci. Inf., Brasília, [online]. 27 (2), pp. 134-140. Available from www.scielo.br/pdf/ci/v27n2/macias.pdf. [Accessed on: 27 jan. 2014].

Majumdar, S. (2010). 'How do they plan for growth in auto component business?' - A study on small foundries of western India. Journal of Business Venturing, 25 (3), pp. 274-289.

Mack, K. (2013). Taking an aesthetic risk in management education: Reflections on an artistic-aesthetic approach. Management Learning, 6, 44 (3), pp. 286-304.

Marti Ripoll, M., Gil Rodriguez, F., Barrasa, A., et al. (2010). Leadership in entrepreneurial organizations: Context and motives. Psicothema, 22 (4), pp. 880-886.

Moore, D. P., Moore, J. L. & Moore, J. W. (2011). How women entrepreneurs lead and why they manage that way. Gender in Management, 26 (3), pp. 220-233.

Nanda, R., Sørensen, J. B. (2010). Workplace peers and entrepreneurship. Management Science, 56 (7), pp. 1116-1126.

Ng, H. S. & Kee, D. M. H. (2013). Organisational culture can be a double-edged sword for firm performance. Research Journal of Business Management, 7 (1), pp. 41-52.

O'Cass, A. & Weerawardena, J. (2009). Examining the role of international entrepreneurship, innovation and international market performance in SME internationalization. European Journal of Marketing, 43 (11-12), pp. 1325-1348.

O'Cass, A. & Weerawardena, J. (2009). Examining the role of international entrepreneurship, innovation and international market performance in SME internationalization. European Journal of Marketing, 43 (11), pp. 1325-1348.

PEREIRA, A. L. & BACHION, M. M. (2006, December). Atualidades em revisão sistemática de literatura, critérios de força e grau de recomendação de evidência. Rev Gaúcha Enferm, Porto Alegre (RS), 27(4), pp. 491-8.

Platzek, B., Pretorius, L. & Winzker, D. (2010, May). A role model for entrepreneurial firms in a global business environment. 6th International Scientific Conference Business and Management. pp. 13-14.

Peris-Ortiz, M. (2009). An analytical model for human resource management as an enabler of organizational renewal: A framework for corporate entrepreneurship. International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal, 5 (4), pp. 461-479.

Schiavo, S. R. (2010). As práticas de trabalho e o processo de aprendizagem de trabalhadores da construção civil à luz da estética organizacional. Dissertation - Graduate Program in Business Administration from the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brazil.

Sørensen, B. M. (2010). St paul's conversion: The aesthetic organization of labour. Organization Studies, 31 (3), pp. 307-326.

Sørensen, J. B. & Fassiotto, M. A. (2011). Organizations as fonts of entrepreneurship. Organization Science 22 (5), pp. 1322-1331.

Strati, A. (2007). Organização e estética. Rio de Janeiro, Brazil.

Strati, A. (1992) Aesthetic understanding of organizational life. The Academy of Management Review, 17(3): 568-581.

Tsaur, S.-H. & Tang, W.-H. (2013). The burden of esthetic labor on front-line employees in hospitality industry. International Journal of Hospitality Management, 35, pp. 19-27.

Tavares, M. das G. P. & Kilimnik, Z. M. (2007) O Conhecimento Estético pode ser uma forma de explicitação do Conhecimento Tácito? Reflexões a partir de dados empíricos. EnADI.

Wang, C. L. & Rafiq, M. (2009). Organizational diversity and shared vision: Resolving the paradox of exploratory and exploitative learning. European Journal of Innovation Management, 12 (1), pp. 86-101.

Wasserman, V. & Frenkel, M. (2011). Organizational aesthetics: Caught between identity regulation and culture jamming. Organization Science, 9, 22 (2), pp. 503-521.