Industrial Democracy as Determinant of Job Satisfaction among Workers of Public Health Institutions in Ogun State, Nigeria

Johnson FEJOH (PhD)
Institute of Education
Faculty of Education
Olabisi Onabanjo University
Ago-Iwoye, Ogun State, Nigeria

Abstract
This study investigated industrial democracy as a determinant of job satisfaction among workers of public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria. The study employed the ex-post-facto research design. In carrying out the research, five hypotheses were generated and tested using an instrument titled “industrial democracy and job satisfaction scale” (IDJSS) which comprised of 20 items. The instrument was administered to a purposely selected population of 100 staff of Olabisi Onabanjo University Teaching Hospital, Sagamu, Ogun State and State Hospital, Ijebu-Ode, Ogun State. Pearson moment correlation coefficient was used to test all the five hypotheses. The findings show that industrial democracy factors of information participation, consultative participation, associative participation, administrative participation and decisive participation have significant positive correlation with workers job satisfaction as follows – information participation ($r=0.622$, $p <0.005$); consultative participation ($r=0.800$, $p<0.05$); associative participation ($r=0.876$, $p<0.005$); administrative participation ($r=0.818$, $p<0.005$) and decisive participation ($r=0.809$, $p<0.005$). The study therefore recommended that managers of tertiary health institutions in Ogun State should develop a platform where all cadres of workers will participate in the management of the institution and be updated with key happenings in the institutions as this will guarantee their satisfaction and higher productivity.

Key words: Industrial Democracy, Workers Participation, Job Satisfaction, Public Health, Tertiary Institution, Ogun State.

Introduction
Industrial democracy is a term generally used to argue that, by analogy with political democracy, workers are entitled to a significant voice in the decisions affecting the organizations in which they work. The term is not used in a consistent manner as it is also used by some workers to argue that any system short of full workers’ control is a denial of industrial democracy and this was the standpoint adopted by union activists in the early decade of the century who advocated a form of guild socialism which was a form of workers’ control of industrial organizations.

In any human society, there must be leaders and followers. In work organization however, it is the management and labour as related to power distribution and structures between the levels. Max Weber (1947) in his classical theory said that power flow from the super-ordinates to the sub-ordinates. Laosebikan (1995) said “all”, as being used to refer to both employers and employees never means equality in status and power but simply in formulation and designing cum execution of policies which has been jointly agreed upon. Industrial democracy is accepted as the same as workers’ participation in management and it is a form of labour-management relations. Industrial democracy in labour-management relations therefore means co-operation to determine and act, and not a manifest of equally either of power of status and or responsibilities. Ogunyemi (1998) looking at industrial democracy said that it is a function of good labour management relations which depicts that sound labour-management relations tends to result into industrial democratization of a work organization.

Migforss (quoted by Ogunyemi, 1998) saw industrial democracy as a struggle of the workers to obtain some share in the technical and economic information of the firm or to give effect to their views.
In reality, industrial democracy as a form of labour-management relations is of two basic forms namely: direct and indirect participations. It is of various models like Joint Ownership Model, Joint Decision Making Model, Workers’ Central Model and Joint Consultation Model. Akintayo (1985) stated that industrial democracy is synonymous with the concept of workers’ participation. It means a set of social or Institutional devices by which subordinate employees, their individually or collectively become involved in one or more aspects of organizational decision making within the enterprises in which they work. Employees inevitably claim the right to share power, to be involved in the making and implementation or decision.

Muller- Jentsch (2008) listed three authors whose definitions of industrial democracy are worthy of mentioning. The first is Korsch (1922), a German author who adopted the term industrial democracy from the Fabian society after a longer stay in London in 1912/13. He literally translated the term into German as ‘Industrielle Demokratie’ but with a much more comprehensive meaning. According to him industrial democracy meant the whole spectrum from workshop participation over collective bargaining to codetermination in the regional and national economy. He indicated this state of codetermination as ‘industrial constitutionalism’ (gewerblicher Konstitutionalismus) being a transitional stage on the road to socialism.

Poole (1992) presented a comprehensive classification of industrial democracy in an article in the “Concise Encyclopaedia of Participation and Co-Management” where he distinguished six different forms:

(i) workers’ self-management
(ii) producer co-operatives
(iii) co-determination
(iv) works councils
(v) trade union action
(vi) Shop-floor programmes.

Trade union action comprises collective bargaining as its most important component, and shop-floor programmes cover direct participation, team work etc. Poole (1992) subsumed the financial participation of employees under the term ‘economic democracy’. In contrast to these broad understandings of industrial democracy, Clegg (1960), confronted us with a radically reductive new approach to industrial democracy. He defined industrial democracy as a mechanism that provides the protecting of the rights and safeguarding the interests of industrial workers. Advocating a model of pure and simple trade unionism he asserted that there is no effective alternative to collective bargaining as a means of protecting the interests and rights of workers.

While expatiating on the level and forms of workers participation in management, Averineni (2012) submitted that workers’ participation is possible at all levels of management. He however added that the only difference is that of degree and nature of application which may be vigorous at lower level and faint at top level.

Job Satisfaction

One of the most challenging tasks in management today is keeping the most qualified employees satisfied and being able to retain them on the job. Armstrong (2006) defined job satisfaction as the attitudes and feelings people have about their work. Positive and favourable attitudes toward the job indicate job satisfaction. Negative and unfavorable attitudes indicate job dissatisfaction. Ngonyama and Ruggunan (2015) viewed job satisfaction as an affective or emotional reaction to the job resulting from the incumbent’s comparison of actual outcomes with the required, anticipated and deserved outcomes. Wright and Kim (2004) explained this comparison by asserting that employees seek to achieve and maintain correspondence with their environment. Correspondence with the environment can be described in terms of the individuals fulfilling the requirements of the environment, and the environment fulfilling the requirements of the individuals.

This means that employees will experience job satisfaction if they feel that their individual capacities, experience and values can be utilized in their work environment and that the work environment offers them those opportunities and rewards (Wright and Kim, 2004). Very often higher learning organizations like any other organization, either private or public, are faced with high labour turn-over. Yet, the main function of a Human Resources Department is to attract, develop and retain skilled employees. Templer and Cawsey (1999) maintained that attracting and retaining high profile employees is a critical feature of globally competitive organizations. For this reason, an organization’s ability to retain knowledgeable workers is a critical component in determining its present and future success.
The loss of knowledgeable workers means the loss of both tangible and intangible knowledge and possibly the loss of competitive advantage (Kinnear and Sutherland, 2000 quoted in Sutherland and Jordaan, 2004). Hence Sutherland and Jordaan (2004) agreed that the retention of key workers is the biggest challenge in human asset management today.

Researchers have shown that job satisfaction is a pre-requisite for employee performance in any organization (Armstrong, 2009). It is important for both the employee and the employer. For the employee, job satisfaction gives them a sense of security and fulfillment. In return, it leads to employee commitment, decreased absenteeism and reduced employee turnover. For the employer, employee job satisfaction ensures committed staff and stable workforce which reduce cost of recruitment and training. According to Stogdill (1965), successful organizations morale is often defined as being equivalent to job satisfaction. Gulon (1998) defined morale as the extent to which an individual’s needs are satisfied and the extent to which the individual perceives satisfaction stemming from his total work situation. Lawler III (1971) defined job satisfaction as the favorableness or unfavorableness with which employees view their work. Satisfaction is an aspect of motivation. Okoth (2003) asserted that job satisfaction is a positive state, resulting from the appraisal of one’s job experiences. Job satisfaction is a collection of feelings and beliefs that managers have about their jobs. She further argued that managers, who are high in job satisfaction generally like their jobs, feel that they are being fairly treated and believe that their jobs have many desirable features such as interesting work, good pay and job security. According to Gumato (2003), job satisfaction is the extent to which employee’s favorably perceive their work. High job satisfaction indicates a strong correlation between an employee’s expectations of the rewards accruing from a job and what the job actually provides. Workers who are satisfied in their jobs will be co-operative and well-motivated while those who are dissatisfied will be more inclined than others to produce low quality output, go on strike, and be absent from work, invoke grievance procedures or even leave the organization.

Work done by Schulze (2005) on job satisfaction of black female academics revealed that factors leading to job satisfaction are teaching autonomy and flexible working hours. Further work by Schulze in 2006 revealed that there was a strong relationship between job satisfaction and physical conditions and support. This study was limited to the Department of Humanities in two different institutions of higher learning. The findings of a case study done by Mammen (2006) on satisfaction of academic staff with terms and conditions of service and their job satisfaction in the Faculty of Science in one of the historically disadvantaged higher learning institution revealed low job satisfaction. This can be associated with uncertainty about the continuity of the institution, inefficiency or dissatisfaction with poor management of the institution itself, problems with financial administration, poor research support, lack of promotion opportunities and high workload. Liebenberg and Barnes (2004) studied the factors influencing a customer service culture in higher education environment and discovered that there was a negative relationship between the corporate culture and job satisfaction.

Statement of the Problem

The agreement among researchers is that industrial democracy is synonymous with workers participation in the management which entails sharing of control with the workers in the work organization. This is to say that the management is doing away with the powers of prerogative, that is, unilateral decisions making capabilities. The concept of industrial democracy is well tolerated in western industrialized countries as opposed to what is obtainable in the Nigerian settings. The ownership structures which is practically tied to who provides the capital for the establishment of the organizations, has made it almost impracticable for workers to fully realize industrial democracy in Nigeria. This affects both public and private organizations. Although modern management insists on the importance of workers participation in decision making but private and most public organizations in Nigeria are still managing on the basis of traditional approach where the decision-making is seen as solely the responsibility of the top management.

The problem of senior workers being saddled with the responsibilities of managing an organization and where such workers see themselves as managers by right is very common in Nigeria. For example, medical doctors see themselves as natural management team of public hospitals in Nigeria to the chagrin of other administrative and non-clinically qualified workers. This has been a source of industrial conflict in many government owned health institutions in Nigeria. Considering the scenario of job satisfaction factors, previous studies have not reported industrial democracy as one of the job satisfaction factors in the public health institutions environment.
This study will therefore assist tertiary health institutions in Ogun State to gauge workers’ participation as one of the factors that may lead to job satisfaction, and then seek ways of encouraging or increasing workers’ participation within the institutions in order to ensure that employees’ level of satisfaction is increased. It is against the background that some workers are not always allowed to lead or participate in the management of public health institutions in Nigeria that this study sought to examine employees’ perception of industrial democracy as a determinant of job satisfaction among workers of public health institutions in Ogun State.

**Objectives of the Study**

This study has the following as its objectives:

(i) To ascertain the level of relationship between information participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(ii) To determine whether there is any significant relationship between consultative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(iii) To examine if there is any relationship between associative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(iv) To ascertain the level of relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria and;

(v) To establish if there any relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

**Research Hypotheses**

The following are the research hypotheses.

(i) There is no significant relationship between information participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(ii) There is no significant relationship between consultative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(iii) There is no significant relationship between associative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(iv) There is no significant relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

(v) There is no significant relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers’ job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State of Nigeria.

**Materials and Methods**

This particular study employed the ex-post-facto research design. The population for this study comprised all members of staff of Olabisi Onabanjo University Teaching Hospital, Sagamu and the State Hospital, Ijebu-Ode. A sample of 100 members of staff comprising of 30 clinically qualified staff and 20 medical staff but not clinical ones in each of the above listed hospitals were randomly selected. The instrument used was mainly the questionnaire which contained 20 items based on the research hypotheses and was structured on a four points Likert scale. The Pearson product moment correlation co-efficient was used to test all the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance. Each of the data was related to the hypotheses with a view of rejecting or failing to reject the hypotheses.

**Table 1: Distribution of Respondents by Sex**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 presents the distribution of respondents by sex which shows that 60(60.0%) of the respondents were male while 40(40.0%) were female. This shows that majority of the respondents that constitute the sample size were male.
Table 2: Distribution of Respondents by Designation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Doctor</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacist</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radiographer</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Record Officer</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Officer</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 depicts the distribution of respondents by designation which shows that 22(22.0%) were doctors, (20(20.0%) were nurses, 21(21.0%) were pharmacists, 3(3.0%) were radiographers, and 11(11.0%) were medical record officers while 23(23.0%) were administrative officers.

The five hypotheses were now tested as follows:

**Ho 1: There is no significant relationship between information participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State**

Table 3: Correlation analysis showing relationship between information participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Probability</th>
<th>Remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information Participation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>16.27</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>0.622</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>0.622</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result in Table 3 revealed a significant outcome (r=0.622,P<0.05). This implied that the mean score on information participation of 16.27 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, the null hypothesis is rejected. Thus, there is a significant relationship between information participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.

**Ho 2: There is no significant relationship between consultative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State**

Table 4: Correlation analysis showing relationship between consultative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Probability</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consultative Participation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15.37</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result in Table 4 revealed a significant outcome (r=0.800,P<0.05). This implied that the mean score on consultative participation of 15.37 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, the null hypothesis is rejected. Thus, there is a significant relationship between consultative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.

**Ho 3: There is no significant relationship between associative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State**

Table 5: Correlation analysis showing relationship between associative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Probability</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Associative Participation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15.63</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>0.876</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>0.876</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result in Table 5 revealed a significant outcome (r=0.876,P<0.05). This implied that the mean score on associative participation of 15.63 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, the null hypothesis is rejected. Thus, there is a significant relationship between associative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.
HO4: There is no significant relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State

Table 6: Correlation analysis showing relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Probability</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Participation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>0.818</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result in Table 6 revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.818, P<0.05$). This implied that the mean score on administrative participation of 15.38 has a significant positively correlation with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, the null hypothesis is rejected. Thus, there is a significant relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.

Ho5: There is no significant relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State

Table 7: Correlation analysis showing relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Probability</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Decisive Participation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15.07</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>0.809</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result in Table 7 revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.809, P<0.05$). This implied that the mean score on decisive participation of 15.38 has a significant positively correlation with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, the null hypothesis is rejected. Thus, there is a significant relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.

Discussions

The results in Table 3 revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.622, P<0.05$). This implies that the mean score on information participation of 16.27 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. The result indicated there is a significant relationship between informative participation of workers in management of the institution and job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State. Workers of public health institutions in Ogun State have job satisfaction when they are able to receive information and express their views pertaining to matters of economic importance especially as it relates to issues of salary and wage adjustments. This has the ability to assist the managers of these health institutions to resolve industrial disputes and other labour related misunderstandings. The result of this study has clearly shown that workers have the tendency to have job satisfaction when they know that important information are actively and regularly shared with them. The above submission was reinforced by Muindi (2011) when she reported that employees’ participation in the management of organizations through participation in decision-making increases intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction. It also reinforces the submission of Wright and Kim (2004) that employees always seek to achieve and maintain correspondence with their environment. Correspondence with the environment can be seen in terms of institutions fulfilling the requirements of the individual workers and the workers also fulfilling the requirements of the institutions.

In addition, the findings in Table 4 revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.800, P<0.05$). This showed that the mean score on consultative participation of 15.37 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. The outcome on this hypothesis agreed with Hertzberg, C. et al (1967) findings that aspect of a job such as responsibility and consultative participation will affect employees’ level of job satisfaction. Table 5 also revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.876, P<0.05$) and this implied that the mean score on associative participation of 15.63 is positively correlated with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level, while Table 6 further revealed a significant outcome ($r=0.818, P<0.05$). This showed that the mean score on administrative participation of 15.38 has a significant positively correlation with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Hence, there is a significant relationship between administrative participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State.
Management is of course not under moral obligation to accept and implement the unanimous decisions of employees. Decisions already taken by the management also come to the employees preferably with alternatives for administration and workers are then left to choose the best alternative for smooth implementation. These two findings above agreed with Gulon (1998) findings that aspects of job such as degree of freedom to act, the scope to use and develop skills and abilities will affect workers’ level of job satisfaction positively.

Finally, the results in Table 7 revealed a significant outcome (r=0.809, P<0.05). This implied that the mean score on decisive participation of 15.38 has a significant positively correlation with the mean score of 27.72 on job satisfaction at the 0.05 level. Thus, there is a significant relationship between decisive participation of workers in organizational management and workers job satisfaction in public health institution in Ogun State. When workers participate at the highest level where decisions are jointly taken on matters relating to production, welfare and other highly important issues in the management of public health institutions, they are bound to have job satisfaction. The result here reinforces Bhatti and Quareshi (2007) posit that high performing effective organizations have a culture that encourages employee involvement.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

The present study was conceived against the background of determining the level of impact of industrial democracy on workers job satisfaction in public health institutions in Ogun State and identifying whether the level attained can determine workers job satisfaction. The finding of this study has clearly established a strong relationship between industrial democracy and employees’ job participation. This has recommended that workers need to participate in the management decisions of their respective health institutions to guarantee job satisfaction which will also bring about higher productivity.

Management of public health institutions in Ogun State should therefore develop a platform where all cadres of workers will participate in the management of the institutions as this will guarantee their job satisfaction and higher productivity. Employees should be updated with the key happenings in the institutions as this also has the capacity to improve workers’ full participation, productivity and job satisfaction.

**References**


Bhatti, K. B., and Quareshi, T. M. (2007). Impact of Employee Participation on Job Satisfaction, Employee Commitment and Employee Productivity. International Review of Business Research Papers. 3(2):54-68


